



South African Institute of Race Relations
The power of ideas

Discontinuity in the National
Executive: 2009–2018
October 2018

GARETH VAN ONSELEN



October 2018

Published by the South African Institute of Race Relations (IRR)
2 Clamart Road, Richmond
Johannesburg, 2092 South Africa
P O Box 291722, Melville, Johannesburg, 2109 South Africa
Telephone: (011) 482-7221
© South African Institute of Race Relations 2018

ISSN: 2311-7591

Members of the Media are free to reprint or report information, either in whole or in part, contained in this publication on the strict understanding that the South African Institute of Race Relations is acknowledged. Otherwise no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopy, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

While the IRR makes all reasonable efforts to publish accurate information and bona fide expression of opinion, it does not give any warranties as to the accuracy and completeness of the information provided. The use of such information by any party shall be entirely at such party's own risk and the IRR accepts no liability arising out of such use.

Author: Gareth van Onselen

Editor-in-chief: Frans Cronje

Editor: Thuthukani Ndebele

Typesetter: Martin Matsokotere

Cover design: InkDesign

EXECUTIVE CHAOS

Introduction

This document comprises two sections. **Section A: The Facts** — sets out the evidence regarding the turmoil in the National Executive. Secondly, all the information in the document is drawn from **Annexure A**, which can be found at the end of this document and comprises an overview of all 14 National Executives between 10 May 2009 and 9 October 2018.

Ideally, from an African National Congress (ANC) perspective, the period 2009-2018 would have comprised two terms under President Jacob Zuma and, in turn, relative continuity (there will inevitably be some changes that have to be made to the executive from time to time). One of the benefits of having both a large majority and a two-term President is a stable national administration and the chance for its members to build up time, experience and a consolidated team in a given portfolio. However, it has instead been a period marked by profound turmoil and dramatic and frequent change, with some time to go still until the next national and provincial election in 2019.

Summary

There have been 14 reconstituted National Executives since 10 May 2009. The average National Executive lasts 245 days (or 165 working days) until it is reconstituted. The longest lasted 540 days (or 372 working days). The shortest lasted just 5 days (or 3 working days). There are 8 National Executives that have lasted less than 200 working days and 4 that have lasted less than 100 working days. There have been 164 changes made to the National Executive since 2009. A total of 94 changes have been made to ministerial positions (including 1 to the position of President) and 70 changes to Deputy Ministerial positions (including 2 to the position of Deputy President). In total, 129 people have served as either a Minister or Deputy Minister since 2009. Some 57 people who once served in either of those positions are no longer part of the National Executive. By the time his second term started, Jacob Zuma's Cabinet retention rate was just 28% (compared to 52% for former President Thabo Mbeki). Of the 64 members selected to the National Executive on 10 May 2009, 37 (or 58%) are no longer part of the Executive and only 7 (11%) retain their original positions. Only 1 ministry — basic education — boasts an unchanged Minister and Deputy Minister since 2009. By contrast, the Ministry of Communications has had 8 different Ministers and 5 different Deputy Ministers (The average Communications Minister serves for 430 days or 294 working days before being reshuffled).

Definitions

This document looks at the extent and nature of the changes made to the 14 National Executives that have held office between 10 May 2009 (the first) and 9 October 2018 (the fourteenth).

The National Executive comprises the President, the Deputy President, all Ministers and all Deputy Ministers. It should be distinguished from the Cabinet, which comprises the President, Deputy President and all Ministers. Changes to the National Executive are done at the discretion of the President.

The current National Executive (as of 9 October 2018) comprises 72 members, including the President, the Deputy President, 34 Ministers and 36 Deputy Ministers, who oversee 37 different ministries. There are, however, 77 positions in the current National Executive, 5 of which are vacant.

The National Executive has grown significantly since the first (10 May 2009). Back then, it comprised 64 members. That is, the President, the Deputy President, 34 Ministers and 28 Deputy Ministers,

who oversaw 34 different ministries. There were, however, 69 positions in the first National Executive, 5 of which were left vacant.

This analysis concerns the two five-year terms under President Jacob Zuma, which ideally would have run from 2009 to 2018, but which were interrupted late into the second term by the election of Cyril Ramaphosa as ANC President and, later, as South Africa's President, on 14 February 2018.

Nevertheless, Ramaphosa does not enjoy a public mandate and, given that the point and benefit of having a two-term President is continuity — and with it experience and knowledge in a given position — it is reasonable to assess the two terms as one.

Finally, while some of these 'reshuffles' are extensive, and others minimal, even small changes can be deeply significant, as South Africa found out on 9 December 2015 when President Zuma removed Nhlanelhla Nene from his position as Finance Minister.

Section A: The Facts

TABLE 1: LENGTH OF EACH RECONSTITUTED NATIONAL EXECUTIVE				
No	Dates	Weeks	Days	Working days
1	10 May 2009 – 31 October 2010	77 weeks, 1 day	540 days	372 working days
2	31 October 2010 – 24 October 2011	51 weeks, 2 days	359 days	245 working days
3	24 October 2011 – 12 June 2012	33 weeks, 2 days	233 days	157 working days
4	12 June 2012 – 3 October 2012	16 weeks, 2 days	114 days	79 working days
5	3 October 2012 – 9 July 2013	40 weeks, 0 days	280 days	190 working days
6	9 July 2013 – 25 May 2014	45 weeks, 6 days	321 days	217 working days
7	25 May 2014 – 22 September 2015	69 weeks, 3 days	486 days	334 working days
8	22 September 2015 – 9 December 2015	11 weeks, 2 days	79 days	55 working days
9	9 December 2015 – 13 December 2015	0 weeks, 5 days	5 days	3 working days
10	13 December 2015 – 30 March 2017	67 weeks, 5 days	474 days	322 working days
11	30 March 2017 – 17 October 2017	28 weeks, 6 days	202 days	136 working days
12	17 October 2017 – 26 February 2018	19 weeks, 0 days	133 days	91 working days
13	26 February 2018 – 9 October 2018	32 weeks, 2 days	226 days	154 working days
14	9 October 2018 —	—	—	—
TOTAL	10 May 2009 – 31 October 2018	491 weeks, 3 days	3 440 days	2 355 working days

- The average National Executive lasts for 245 days or 165 working days (or 35 weeks).
- The longest was the first, which lasted 540 days (or 372 working days) from 10 May 2009 to 31 October 2010.
- The shortest was the ninth, which lasted just 5 days (or 3 working days) from 9 December 2015 to 13 December 2015.
- 8 National Executives have lasted less than 200 working days; 4 have lasted less than 100 working days.
- Just 3 National Executives have lasted longer than a year, without interruption.

TABLE 2: EXTENT OF THE CHANGES MADE TO THE NATIONAL EXECUTIVE				
No	Date reconstituted	Number of changes	Changes to Ministers	Changes to Deputy Ministers
1	10-May-09	–	–	–
2	31-Oct-10	26	9	17
3	24-Oct-11	9	4	5
4	12-Jun-12	8	4	4
5	3-Oct-12	2	2	0
6	9-Jul-13	9	5	4
7	25-May-14	47	25	22
8	22-Sep-15	2	2	0
9	9-Dec-15	1	1	0
10	13-Dec-15	2	2	0
11	30-Mar-17	20	10	10
12	17-Oct-17	6	5	1
13	26-Feb-18	31	24*	7**
14	9-Oct-18	1	1	0
TOTAL	—	164	94	70
*Including a new President **Including two new Deputy Presidents				

- There have been 164 changes made to the National Executive since 2009. 94 changes have been made to ministerial positions (including one to the position of President) and 70 changes to deputy ministerial positions (including two to the position of Deputy President).
- The most comprehensive set of changes was made to the seventh Executive, when 47 positions were changed — that is 25 to ministerial positions and 22 to deputy ministerial positions.
- On two occasions just 1 change has been made to the Executive (in both cases the ninth and fourteenth executives) to the position of Finance Minister.
- The average number of changes per reshuffle is 11.4 (6.4 ministerial positions and 5 deputy ministerial positions).
- Because changes were made to ministerial positions in every reshuffle, there have also been 14 different Cabinets since 10 May 2009.

The retention rate

- Jacob Zuma’s first Executive (10 May 2009) comprised 64 members: the President, the Deputy President, 34 Ministers and 28 Deputy Ministers, who oversaw 34 different ministries. By comparing the number of Ministers who held the same position when he constituted his first Cabinet for his second administration (his seventh Executive in all, on 25 May 2014), it is possible to determine the retention rate. We can use the same former President’s first-term Cabinet and his Cabinet at the start of his second term, for the purposes of comparison. Those ministries that were restructured have been excluded.

TABLE 3: JACOB ZUMA'S FIRST- AND SECOND-TERM CABINETS

No	Ministry	First-Term Cabinet	Second-Term Cabinet
		START: 10 May 2009	START: 25 May 2014
1	President	Mr JG Zuma	Mr JG Zuma
2	Deputy President	Mr K Motlanthe	Mr C Ramaphosa
3	Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries	Ms T Joemat-Pettersson	Mr S Zokwana
4	Arts and Culture	Ms L Xingwana	Mr N Mthethwa
5	Basic Education	Ms MA Motshekga	Ms MA Motshekga
6	Communications	Mr S Nyanda	Ms F Muthambi
7	Cooperative Governance	Mr S Shiceka	Mr PJ Gordhan
8	Correctional Services and Justice	Ms NN Mapisa-Nqakula	Mr M Masutha
9	Defence and Military Veterans	Ms L Sisulu	Ms NN Mapisa-Nqakula
10	Economic Development	Mr E Patel	Mr E Patel
11	Energy	Ms ED Peters	Ms T Joemat-Pettersson
12	Finance	Mr PJ Gordhan	Mr NM Nene
13	Health	Dr PA Motsoaledi	Dr PA Motsoaledi
14	Higher Education and Training	Dr BE Nzimande	Dr BE Nzimande
15	Home Affairs	Dr N Dlamini-Zuma	Mr MKN Gigaba
16	Human Settlements	Mr TME Sexwale	Ms L Sisulu
17	International Relations and Cooperation	Ms ME Nkoana-Mashabane	Ms ME Nkoana-Mashabane
18	Labour	Mr M Mdladlana	Ms MN Oliphant
19	Mineral Resources	Ms S Shabangu	Adv N Ramathlodi
20	Police	Mr N Mthethwa	Mr N Nhleko
21	Public Enterprises	Ms B Hogan	Ms L Brown
22	Public Service and Administration	Mr R Baloyi	Mr OC Chabane
23	Public Works	Mr G Doidge	Mr TW Nxesi
24	Rural Development and Land Reform	Mr G Nkwinti	Mr G Nkwinti
25	Science and Technology	Ms N Pandor	Ms N Pandor
26	Social Development	Ms E Molewa	Ms BO Dlamini
27	Sport and Recreation	Mr M Stofile	Mr F Mbalula
28	State Security	Dr SC Cwele	Mr D Mahlobo
29	Tourism	Mr M van Schalkwyk	Mr DA Hanekom
30	Trade and Industry	Dr R Davies	Dr R Davies
31	Transport	Mr SJ Ndebele	Ms ED Peters
32	Water and Environmental Affairs	Ms B Sonjica	Ms N Mokonyane

TABLE 4: THABO MBEKI'S FIRST- AND SECOND-TERM CABINETS

No	Ministry	First-Term Cabinet	Second-Term Cabinet
		START: 17 June 1999	START: 27 April 2004
1	President of South Africa	Mr T Mbeki	Mr T Mbeki
2	Deputy President of South Africa	Mr J Zuma	Mr J Zuma
3	Agriculture and Land Affairs	Ms T Didiza	Ms T Didiza
4	Arts and Culture	Mr B Ngubane	Mr P Jordan
5	Communications	Ms I Matsepe-Casaburri	Ms I Matsepe-Casaburri
6	Correctional Services	Mr B Skosana	Mr N Balfour
7	Defence	Mr M Lekota	Mr M Lekota
8	Education	Mr K Asmal	Ms N Pandor
9	Environmental Affairs and Tourism	Mr V Moosa	Mr M van Schalkwyk
10	Finance	Mr T Manuel	Mr T Manuel
11	Foreign Affairs	Ms N Dlamini-Zuma	Ms N Dlamini-Zuma
12	Health	Ms M Tshabalala-Msimang	Ms M Tshabalala-Msimang
13	Home Affairs	Mr M Buthelezi	Ms N Mapisa-Nqakula
14	Housing	Ms S Mthembu-Mahanyele	Ms L Sisulu
15	Intelligence Services	Mr J Nhlanhla	Mr R Kasrils
16	Justice and Constitutional Development	Mr P Maduna	Mr B Mabandla
17	Labour	Mr M Mdladlana	Mr M Mdladlana
18	Minerals and Energy	Ms P Mlambo-Ngcuka	Ms L Hendricks
19	Provincial and Local Government	Mr S Mufamadi	Mr S Mufamadi
20	Public Enterprises	Mr A Erwin	Mr A Erwin
21	Public Service and Administration	Ms G Fraser-Moleketi	Ms G Fraser-Moleketi
22	Public Works	Ms S Sigcau	Ms S Sigcau
23	Safety and Security	Mr S Tshwete	Mr C Nqakula
24	Science and Technology	Mr B Ngubane	Mr M Mangena
25	Social Development	Mr Z Skweyiya	Mr Z Skweyiya
26	Sport and Recreation	Mr N Balfour	Mr A Stofile
27	The Presidency	Mr E Pahad	Me E Pahad
28	Transport	Mr D Omar	Mr J Radebe
29	Water Affairs and Forestry	Mr R Kasrils	Ms P Sonjica

- Of the 32 members in Jacob Zuma's first-term Cabinet, 9 held the same position when he announced his second-term Cabinet. That constitutes a retention rate of 28%.
- By comparison, of the 29 members in Thabo Mbeki's first-term Cabinet, 15 held the same position when he announced his second-term Cabinet. That constitutes a retention rate of 52%.

First Executive retention rate: 2009 versus 2018

- Using Jacob Zuma's first full Executive (the President, Deputy President, 34 Ministers and 28 Deputy Ministers) on 10 May 2009, it is possible to track over the course of the next nine years and 13 re-shuffles how many members of the original are still in the same positions in the Executive or are no longer part of it.
- Of the 34 Ministers selected on 10 May 2009, only 4 retain their original positions: Ms M A Motshekga (basic education); Mr E Patel (economic development); Dr PA Motsoaledi (health) and Dr R Davies (trade and industry).

- 19 Ministers from 2009 are no longer part of the Executive: Ms T Joemat-Pettersson (agriculture); Ms L Xingwana (arts and culture); Mr S Nyanda (communications); Mr S Shiceka (co-operative governance); Ms ED Peters (energy); Mr TME Sexwale (human settlements); Mr M Mdladlana (labour); Ms S Shabangu (mining); Ms B Hogan (public enterprises); Mr R Baloyi (public service and administration); Mr G Doidge (public works); Ms E Molewa (social development); Mr M Stofile (sport); Mr TA Manuel (national planning); Mr OC Chabane (performance monitoring); Mr M van Schalkwyk (tourism); Mr SJ Ndebele (transport); Ms B Sonjica (water affairs) and Ms N Mayende-Sibiya (women, children, disabilities).
- Both the President (Mr JG Zuma) and the Deputy President (Mr K Motlanthe) are also no longer part of the Executive.
- Of the 28 Deputy Ministers selected on 10 May 2009, only 3 retain their original positions: Mr E Surty (basic education); Ms ZA Kota-Fredericks (human settlements) and Mr GC Oosthuizen (sport).
- 16 Deputy Ministers from 2009 are no longer part of the executive: Dr PW Mulder (agriculture); Mr P Mashatile (arts and culture); Ms D Pule (communications); Mr Y Carrim (co-operative governance); Prof HB Mkhize (correctional services); Ms G Mahlangu-Nkabinde (economic development); Mr NM Nene (finance); Dr M Sefularo (health); Mr EI Ebrahim (international relations); Ms S van der Merwe (international relations); Mr F Mbalula (police); Mr E Godongwana (public enterprises); Mr R Padayachie (public service and administration); Ms TV Tobias-Pokolo (trade and industry); Ms BM Ntuli (trade and industry) and Ms RT Mabudafhasi (water affairs).
- In total, of the 64 members selected to the National Executive on 10 May 2009, 37 (or 58%) are no longer part of the executive.
- In total, of the 64 members selected to the National Executive on 10 May 2009, only 7 (11%) retain their original positions.
- There are 22 members (34%) of the 2009 Executive, who have survived every reshuffle, in the same position or who have been moved to different positions: Dr PA Motsoaledi; Dr R Davies; Dr SC Cwele; Mr AC Nel; Mr E Patel; Mr E Surty; Mr G Nkwinti; Mr GC Oosthuizen; Mr J Cronin; Mr JT Radebe; Mr MKN Gigaba; Mr N Mthethwa; Mr T Makwetla; Ms BO Dlamini; Ms L Sisulu; Ms MA Motshekga; Ms ME Nkoana-Mashabane; Ms N Pandor; Ms NN Mapisa-Nqakula; Ms S Shabangu; Ms T Xasa and Ms ZA Kota-Fredericks.

Full list of those no longer part of the Executive

- Across all 14 Executives since 2009, 57 people have at one stage been a Minister or Deputy minister but are no longer part of the Executive: Adv. N Ramatlhodi; Dr G Ramokgopa; Dr M Sefularo; Dr PW Mulder; Mr B Martins; Mr BT Bongo; Mr D Mahlobo; Mr DDD Van Rooyen; Mr E Godongwana; Mr EI Ebrahim; Mr F Mbalula; Mr G Doidge; Mr J Maswanganyi; Mr JG Zuma; Mr SJ Ndebele; Mr K Motlanthe; Mr M Fransman; Mr M Jonas; Mr M Manana; Mr M Masina; Mr M Mdladlana; Mr M Stofile; Mr M van Schalkwyk; Mr MJ Zwane; Mr N Nhleko; Mr NM Nene; Mr OC Chabane; Mr P Mashatile; Mr R Baloyi; Mr R Padayachie; Mr S Nyanda; Mr S Shiceka; Mr SJ Ndebele; Mr SL Tsenoli; Mr TA Manuel; Mr TME Sexwale; Mr Y Carrim; Ms B Hogan; Ms B Sonjica; Ms BE Molewa; Ms BM Ntuli; Ms C September; Ms D Pule; Ms ED Peters; Ms F Muthambi; Ms G Mahlangu-Nkabinde; Ms L Brown; Ms L Xingwana; Ms M Kubayi; Ms N Mayende-Sibiya; Ms N November; Ms RT Mabudafhasi; Ms S van der Merwe; Ms T Joemat-Pettersson; Ms T Mahambehlala; Ms TV Tobias-Pokolo and Prof HB Mkhize.
- Given that the current National Executive comprises a further 72 members, there are now 129 people who have served as either a Minister or Deputy Minister since 2009.

The most unstable Ministries

1. **Communications:** 8 Ministers, 5 Deputy Ministers (The average Communications Minister serves for 430 days or 294 working days)
2. **Finance:** 7 Ministers, 4 Deputy Ministers (The average Finance Minister serves for 491 days or 336 working days)
3. **Public Service and Administration:** 7 Ministers, 4 Deputy Ministers
4. **Energy:** 6 Ministers, 2 Deputy Ministers (The average Energy Minister serves for 573 days or 392 working days)
5. **Co-operative Governance:** 6 Ministers, 3 Deputy Ministers
6. **Home Affairs:** 6 Ministers, 3 Deputy Ministers
7. **Public Works:** 5 Ministers, 2 Deputy Ministers
8. **Transport:** 5 Ministers, 2 Deputy Ministers (The average Transport Minister serves for 688 days or 471 working days).

The most stable Ministries

1. **Basic Education:** 1 Minister, 1 Deputy Minister
2. **Telecommunications and Postal Service:** 1 Minister, 2 Deputy Ministers (since 2014)
3. **Small Business Development:** 1 Minister, 3 Deputy Ministers (since 2014)
4. **Health:** 1 Minister, 3 Deputy Ministers
5. **Economic Development:** 1 Minister, 4 Deputy Ministers
6. **Trade and Industry:** 1 Minister, 5 Deputy Ministers (2 Deputy Minister positions).

The most reshuffled Ministers

The following have served in the greatest number of positions:

- **Prof HB Mkhize:** 6 positions (Deputy Minister of Correctional Services, Deputy Minister of Higher Education, Deputy Minister of Economic Development, Deputy Minister of Telecommunications and Postal Service, Minister of Home Affairs and Minister of Higher Education).
- **Mr MKN Gigaba:** 5 positions (Deputy Minister of Home Affairs, Minister of Public Enterprises, Minister of Home Affairs, Minister of Finance, Minister of Home Affairs again).



South African Institute of Race Relations

The power of ideas

2 Clamart Road, Richmond, Johannesburg, 2092 South Africa

P O Box 291722, Melville, 2109 South Africa

t. 011 482 7221

info@irr.org.za | www.irr.org.za